

---

## Book Reviews

---

*Jane Addams and the Dream of American Democracy.* Jean Bethke Elshtain. New York: Basic Books, 2002.

**Reviewed by** Rodney B. Dieser  
School of Health, Physical Education, and Leisure Services  
University of Northern Iowa.  
Cedar Falls, Iowa

The stated goal of *Jane Addams and the dream of American democracy* is to “. . .draw the curtain of historical mist and dust that has obscured Addams and blurred her reputation” (p. xxii). One layer of the historical mist that Elshtain attempts to clarify is how Jane Addams’ human service work was rooted in Christianity. Elshtain underscores that Jane Addams imitates Christ through a service ethic. In regard to dust that has obscured Jane Addams, Elshtain writes: “There are days when I think the world has passed her [Jane Addams] by; that she is so securely lodged in a bygone era that it is impossible to draw her into a conversation about our situation. . .” (p. 253-254). There are two primary reasons why leisure professionals and educators should remember Jane Addams. First, the political battles and services that Jane Addams and her colleagues at Hull-House developed fostered the play movement and the contemporary fields of leisure, youth, and human services. Second, her ideas related to the First World War can develop important discussions regarding the War on Terror in the contemporary period. For example, Jane Addams’ concerns regarding World War I are readily apparent in regard to the War on Terror (e.g., undermining human kindness and civic friendship, highlighting the mythical image of U.S. soldiers being stalwart warriors,<sup>1</sup> using military approaches instead of diplomatic solutions). Elshtain’s hope is that “. . .readers of this book will go on to read Addams’s own writing, in order to fully appreciate her intellect and her passion for civic life” (p. xxii). Hence, a companion book edited by Jean Elshtain (2002), *The Jane Addams Reader*, has been published which includes excerpts from each of Jane Addams’ books, as well as essays from journals and newspapers.

Chapter one, *The Snare of Preparation*, provides a chronology of Jane Addams’ life and posits that her image and ideas are often distorted. The first seventeen pages outline her life and her many accomplishments (e.g., Hull-House, Nobel Peace Prize, Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom). Elshtain highlights the existing distorted images of Jane Addams and Hull-House, such as an assimilator of immigrants and the grandiose

---

<sup>1</sup> The accounting of Jessica Lynch in the new book *I am a soldier, too: The Jessica Lynch story* (Braggs, 2003) debunks (1) the military version of the stalwart soldier rhetoric of rescuing Jessica Lynch and, (2) the military interpretation that Jessica Lynch was a brave hero who went down shooting.

image that Hull-House was perfect.<sup>2</sup> To this end, Elshtain suggests that distortions of Jane Addams result from the changes over time of images of American womanhood. For example, Elshtain posits that the Catholic and Christian concept of friendship during the late 1800s is often confused with lesbian discourse of the contemporary period and argues that the sexualizing of Jane Addams is used to “. . . conform to the political exigencies of our age” (p. 23). That is, Elshtain suggests that contemporary interpretations of Jane Addams apply late twentieth-century standards to nineteenth-century persons.

The thesis of chapter two, *One Pilgrim's Progress*, is that Jane Addams' pilgrim process developed her ethic and vision of Hull-House. Elshtain posited that John Bunyan's treatise *Pilgrim's Progress*<sup>3</sup> was a book that played a role in shaping the narrative structure of Jane Addams' life—it was “. . . part of the air Jane Addams breathed” (p. 41). Historically, John Bunyan was a religious nonconformist in the mid-seventeenth century living in England who spent 12 years in the Bedford prison for open preaching against dominant doctrines and for fostering a conventicle movement (Forest & Greaves, 1982). Bunyan's *Pilgrim's Progress* attempts to unmask the Christian gap between word and deed so that this gap can be narrowed. Like the protagonist named Christian in this classic book, Elshtain argues that Jane Addams also tried to narrow the gap between Christian word and deed by highlighting that many Christian churches felt no lure in the hideously uncouth factories in which men and women sometimes worked twelve hours a day for seven days in a week until they were utterly brutalized by fatigue; nor in the unsanitary tenements so crowded that the mere decencies of life were often impossible (see Addams 1911/2002).

Chapter three, *Imagining Hull-House*, is oriented toward how Jane Addams' travels to Europe were the antecedent to imagining Hull-House. Although Elshtain provides no new historical interpretations of Jane Addams and her travels to Europe, she attempts to interpret Jane Addams' travels primarily through her own writings, so that Jane Addams' distinct voice can be heard. Hence, there are lengthy quotations in this chapter (and throughout the book) that allow readers to hear and understand Jane Addams' European travel experiences.

Chapter four, *The Family Claim and the Social Claim*, explains how Jane Addams and Hull-House services attempted to change social conditions to help families and people struggling to live. To this end, Elshtain draws upon Addams' (1983/2002) treatise *The Subjectivity Necessity for Social Settlements* in sharing the three-fold mission of Hull-House: foster social democracy, share the race life, and provide a renaissance of Christian service rooted in early

---

<sup>2</sup>Lissak (1989) argued that Jane Addams used human services to assimilate immigrants into Euro-North American culture. In 1990 a special edition of *Life* magazine presents Jane Addams and Hull-House as a perfect society.

<sup>3</sup>The first part of *Pilgrim's Progress* was originally published in 1678 and the second part published in 1684.

humanitarian aspects. Elshtain argues that Jane Addams was oriented toward system-directed change—to keep families safe, community and societal conditions must be improved. Again, Elshtain uses lengthy quotations to allow Jane Addams' voice to be heard. For example, Elshtain uses the following heartbreaking story by Jane Addams to illustrate how families are harmed when social realities are not addressed:<sup>4</sup>

One March morning, Goosie's mother was hanging out the washing on a shed roof at six o'clock, doing it thus early before she left for the factory. Five-year-old Goosie was trotting at her heels handing her clothespins, when he has suddenly blown off the roof by the high wind into the alley below. His neck was broken by the fall and as he lay piteous and limp on a pile of frozen refuse, his mother cheerily called him to "climb up again," so confident do overworked mothers become that their children cannot get hurt. After the funeral, as the poor mother sat in the nursery postponing the moment when she must go back to her empty room, I asked her in a futile effort to be of comfort, if there was anything more we could do for her. The overworked, sorrow-stricken woman looked up and replied, "If you could give me my wages for to-morrow, I would not go to work in the factory at all. I would like to stay at home all day and hold the baby. Goosie was always asking me to take him and I never had any time." This statement revealed the conditions of many nursery mothers who were obligated to forego the joys and solaces which belong to even the most poverty-stricken. The long hours of factory labor necessary for earning the support of a child leave no time for the tender care and caressing which may enrich the life of the most piteous baby. (p. 105)

In the latter part of this chapter Elshtain highlights how Jane Addams believed that societal duties take precedence over individual rights.

Chapter five, *Compassion Without Condescension: The Child and the City*, is most relevant to recreation and leisure educators and practitioners. Elshtain posits Jane Addams' notion that play and recreation programs are needed because cities are destroying the spirit of youth. In this chapter, Elshtain draws heavily upon Addams' classic 1909 book *The Spirit of Youth and the City Streets*. Elshtain does not offer any new insights—she highlights Jane Addams' arguments that cities/capitalism are killing the spirit of youth and how recreation and play are healthy mediums to channel the spirit of youth. Although Elshtain is fair-minded in explaining different play and recreation programs provided at Hull-House (e.g., art, drama, labor museum, playground) as an educator in leisure services, I was a bit disappointed that Elshtain did not provide greater depth and breadth regarding the importance of play, recreation, and leisure services. Perhaps my own academic filters are obscuring my perspective, but Elshtain could have provided greater depth regarding the ". . . undoubted powers of public recreation to bring together the classes of a community in the modern city unhappily so full of devices for keeping them apart" (Addams, 1909, p. 96) instead of focusing on how recreation can be used solely as channeling the spirit of youth. Fur-

---

<sup>4</sup>The original story appears in Jane Addams' (1910/1981) book *Twenty years at Hull-House*.

thermore, although Elshtain mentioned that Jane Addams worked on the Board of Health, no attention is devoted to how Jane Addams served as the first vice-president of the Playground Association of America.

The thesis of chapter six, *Woman's Remembering Heart*, is that women should be involved in municipal/civic housekeeping. Municipal/civic housekeeping is being responsible for the community. Jane Addams posited that women, as opposed to men, are trained in the delicate matters of human welfare and need to build upon their traditional roles of housekeeping to be municipal/civic housekeepers. Enlarged housekeeping duties (e.g., cleaning poisonous sewage, fixing impure milk processing, cleaning smoke-laden air, upgrading unsafe factory conditions) would keep people, families and communities safe. For example, Elshtain highlighted how the garbage wars of Chicago exemplified municipal/civic housekeeping—in 1894 Jane Addams became the first woman appointed as sanitary inspector of the Chicago 19<sup>th</sup> ward. With the help of the Hull-House Women's Club, within a year over 1000 health department violations were reported to city counsel and garbage collection reduced death and disease. Furthermore, throughout this chapter Elshtain continues to interpret Jane Addams' human service work as rooted in Christianity. For example, in the early part of this chapter Elshtain claims that Jane Addams' concept of the self is located in the Christian concept of the giving-self:

There is a parable in *Twenty Years at Hull-House* that illustrates this idea [of a giving self]. . . It is one that many commentators have found curious or have simply ignored, but it is key to understanding Addams's view of the self. . . The story may be curious, but it is not mysterious to those familiar with the Christian understanding of a kenotic or 'emptying' self. Had not the Master [Jesus Christ] taught that those who lose themselves for His sake would truly find themselves? (p. 153)

Elshtain interprets the story/parable of the large toad who swallowed the small toad as Jane Addams losing herself in following the Christian belief of serving others. Further, Elshtain underscores how Jane Addams was a bread-giver—similar to the Christian interpretation that Jesus Christ is the bread of life.

Chapter seven, *Life has Marked us with its Slow Stain: The War at Home*, illustrates how a slow stain moved upon Hull-House as Jane Addams became involved in politics. When Jane Addams ran against Johnny Powers for an alderman position, her political battle opened her and other women to the criticism that women should not be involved in political matters. Likewise, when Jane Addams endorsed and seconded the nomination of Theodore Roosevelt at the Progressive Party convention in 1912 she moved away from the social settlement policy to be politically neutral. Due to the fact that Hull-House was open to freedom of speech and political debates of any nature (e.g., anarchism, Plato, socialism), Hull-House began to be stained within the community and nation. For example, after a self-proclaimed anarchist assassinated President McKinley, journalistic rhetoric located Hull-House as a socialistic evil that harbored anarchists and terrorists.

Chapter eight, *Solidarity Which will not Waver: Jane Addams in War and Peace*, further documents how Jane Addams fell from grace in the public arena due to her pacifist stance and defense of immigrants during World War I. Although Addams' popularity was decreasing as she increased her pacifism during World War I, Elshtain underscored Addams' famous bayonet charge speech at Carnegie Hall on July 9, 1915 as her undoing because she challenged the dominant male-oriented war-mongering discourse of the day. To Jane Addams, war was a cataclysm that undermined human kindness, solidarity, civic friendship, and caused families across the world to struggle. The latter part of this chapter highlights that after the Great War the anti-Jane Addams rhetoric gradually subsided and provides a chronology of the last few years of her life (e.g., awarded the Nobel Peace Prize in 1931, struggles with cancer).

*Jane Addams and the dream of American democracy* ends with a short, but moving, four page afterwards section which begins with the lyrics of Bob Dylan's song "Shelter from the Storm." It is a personal narrative of Elshtain visiting Jane Addams' hometown—the tiny community of Cedarville in January of 2001. In it Elshtain explains Jane Addams' original home, the Cedar Creek and wilderness play area (her childhood fairyland), and the Addams family gravesite. The last paragraph of the book summarizes the life of Jane Addams and implicitly links it to a Christian ethic:

This much is clear: All those who were, in one way or another alien or foreign, she [Jane Addams] welcomed as neighbors. We are all bidden, she insisted, to welcome them. "Come in," she said. "I'm just having some tea. Would you care to join me?" In this she never wavered. She was braver than we . . . Come in, she said. There is shelter from the storm." (p. 254)

Overall, I believe Elshtain has accomplished her purpose of lifting the curtain of historical mist and dust that has obscured and blurred Jane Addams. Elshtain demonstrates how Jane Addams' human service work was rooted in Christianity and begins an important discussion of Jane Addams in the contemporary period. Throughout *Jane Addams and the dream of American democracy* Elshtain presents Jane Addams' own writings, so that her distinct voice can be re-heard. That is to say, Elshtain's interpretation of Jane Addams aligns to Jane Addams' style of writing. Jane Addams used powerful stories and narratives to inform and support her arguments. In the same manner, Elshtain uses lengthy quotations from Jane Addams' original sources so that her narratives and arguments can be heard again. The extensive and meticulous endnote provides any reader the opportunity to verify the credibility of Elshtain's historical research and interpretations. Furthermore, although many scholars have written about Jane Addams (e.g., Deegan, 1988; Lasch, 1965; Linn, 1935), including her spiritual background (e.g., Stebner, 1997), I believe that Elshtain linkage of Jane Addams to John Bunyan is a unique historical interpretation regarding the life of Jane Addams.

Although, I believe that *Jane Addams and the dream of American democracy* provides a fair-minded representation of Jane Addams, I have two concerns.

First, Elshtain may have fallen into the trap of presenting the distorted grandiose image that Jane Addams and Hull-House was perfect. Elshtain does underscore some problematic aspects of Jane Addams, such as when she accidentally angered local neighbors by planning a county burial for an abandoned immigrant infant. However, Elshtain's interpretation of Jane Addams provides scant attention of the troubling aspects of Jane Addams. For example, Philpott (1991) underscored how blocks of tenement houses had to be destroyed to establish the Hull-House playground, which resulted in dispossessed community members becoming unsympathetic and callous of Jane Addams and Hull-House. The historical accounting of Jane Addams is presented in a positive and progressive manner that does not give voice to faulty calculations, accidents, and non-humane practices.<sup>5</sup> Second, I have a difficult time with the individualistic representation of Jane Addams—she is presented as a strong individual who had a great amount of self-determination. I agree that Jane Addams was a strong individual but she was collectivistic—she had a network of strong-minded colleagues and supporters, such as Ellen Gates Starr, Alice Hamilton, Julia Lathrop, Louise deKoven Bowen, John Dewey, George Herbert Mead, just to name a few. Further, as stated by Elshtain, Jane Addams loathed individualism. Perhaps this is why Linn (1935) commented, “A biography of Jane Addams that did not include special mention of this group [Hull-House people] would be absurd” (p. 130). Simply stated, I believe that Elshtain representation of Jane Addams is too individualistic.

Despite these limitations, *Jane Addams and the dream of American democracy* has an important place in leisure studies. It can be used in any undergraduate or graduate class that focuses on the history and philosophy of recreation and leisure. If supplemented with literature that focuses on how Jane Addams used leisure and play in human service work at Hull-House this book has an important place in leisure studies because it will help leisure professionals and educators remember this great and remarkable woman.

### References

- Addams, J. (1893/2002). The subjective necessity for social settlements. In J. B. Elshtain (Eds.), *The Jane Addams reader* (pp. 14-28). New York: Basic Books. (Reprinted from *Philanthropy and social progress, Seven essays by Miss Jane Addams, Robert. A. Woods, Father J. O. S. Huntington, Professor Franklin H. Giddings and Bernard Bosanquet* by Henry C. Adams, Ed., 1893, New York: Thomas Y. Crowell).
- Addams, J. (1909). *The spirit of youth and the city streets*. New York: Macmillan.
- Addams, J. (1910/1981). *Twenty years at Hull-House*. New York: Signet classic.
- Addams, J. (1911/2002). Religious education and contemporary social conditions. In J. B. Elshtain (Eds.), *The Jane Addams reader* (pp. 196-204). New York: Basic Books. (Reprinted from the *Journal of the Religious Education Association*, Vol. 6, June, 1911).
- Braggs, R. (2003). *I am a soldier, too: The Jessica Lynch story*. New York, Knopf.

<sup>5</sup>Foucault (1971/1998) argued that human services have not developed rationally, but from faulty calculations and accidents that are rarely reported by historians.

- Deegan, M. J. (1988). *Jane Addams and the men of the Chicago school, 1892-1918*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Books.
- Elshtain, J. B. (2002). *The Jane Addams reader*. New York: Basic Books.
- Foucault, M. (1971/1998). Nietzsche, genealogy, history. In J. D. Faubion (Ed.), *Essential works of Michel Foucault 1954-1984 Volume 2: Aesthetics, method, and epistemology* (pp. 369-391). New York: The New Press.
- Forest, J. F., & Greaves, R. L. (1982). *John Bunyan: A reference guide*. Boston, MA: G. K. Hall and Company.
- Jane Addams: A reformer fought for the many causes of the forgotten. (1990, Fall). *Life*, 13(2), 61.
- Lasch, C. (1965). *The social thought of Jane Addams*. Indianapolis, IN: Bobbs-Merrill Company.
- Linn, J. W. (1935). *Jane Addams: A biography*. New York: D. Appleton-Century Company.
- Lissak, R. S. (1989). *Pluralism and progressives: Hull-House and the new immigrants*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Philpott, T. L. (1991). *The slum and the ghetto: Immigrants, Blacks, and reformers in Chicago, 1880-1930*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- Stebner, E. J. (1997). *The women of Hull-House: A study in spirituality, vocation, and friendship*. New York: State University of New York Press.

*Tourism in Western Europe: A Collection of Case Histories*. Richard Voase (Editor). UK: CABI Publishing, 2002.

**Reviewed by** Kyriaki Kaplanidou

Department of Park, Recreation and Tourism Resources  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, Michigan

Richard Voase provides an interesting collection of case studies regarding Western European tourism development. The case studies are well organized in three thematic areas based on political, economic and socio-cultural contexts. The collection of stories communicates changes in tourism development and practices and reflects how tourism development seeks for new ways of tourism thinking. Voase concludes that tourism experiences, on the part of travelers, show signs of active decision making with passive consumption. This point prompts the reader to think that tourists choose "canned" experiences that are creatively constructed, however accessed through extensive information search and decision-making.

The case studies are authored by a variety of authors with strong local ties to the place they write about which enables extraordinary insight into issues the tourism industry faces in Europe and North America (although North America is not the focus of this book). This book can be used in a tourism development course to help students identify current issues in tourism (e.g., environmental challenges, sustainability, conservation approaches) and build upon definitions and theoretical models in tourism.

In his introduction, Voase conveys that the analysis or interpretation of the cases is based on political, economic, socio-cultural and technological environments. The analysis, captures the multidimensionality of the tourism product and the cultural and social factors that relate to current ideologies,